## 21 WEST $76^{\mathrm{TH}}$

NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10023

## Ematl:

DAVIS@CLAREMONTGROUPLTD.COM
The Honorable Meenakshi Srivivasan, Chair
NYC Board of Standards and Appeals
9th Floor
40 Rector Street
New York, NY 10006

TEL: (212) 697-6665
FAX: (212) 697-8902
Reference:
Calendar 74-07-BZ
6-10 West 70th Street
New York, NY
June 10, 2008

Honorable Chair and Members of the Board of Standards and Appeals:
Congregation Shearith Israel (CSI) has not produced the required acquisition costs and dates for 6-10 West 70 th Street, Lots 37, 38, and 39 on Block 1122.

Item M-5, Financial Feasibility Study, BSA Rules, state:

> 5. Generally, for cooperative or condominium development proposals the following information is required: market value of the property, acquisition costs and date of acquisition, ...... and percentage return on equity (net profit divided by equity). [Emphasis added]

Appendix I shows the range of possible acquisition costs in 1949 for $6-8 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$ and in 1965 for $10 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$. These acquisition costs are restated in 2008 dollars, using the Consumer Price Index (CPI) inflator, for a total acquisition cost of \$1,033,000.

To determine if a reasonable return on the property is not possible, Item M-3, Financial Feasibility Study, BSA Rules, states:
3. The economic hardship that arises from the unique physical conditions must be quantified.....

Returns on equity for the three lots as a whole were calculated using three Freeman/Frazer Associates (FFA) scenarios: the FFA Proposed Development case of the May 13, 2008 submission and the FAA As-of-Right cases, AOR Scheme A and the AOR Scheme C, both dated December 21, 2008. Two valuations, on each of these cases, were calculated based on FFA residential values scaled and FFA $\$ 625 /$ square foot. Platt Byard Dovell White's (PBDW's) square footage numbers were used.

The lowest return is AOR Scheme C at a Net Profit on the property of $\$ 13.7$ million, a $1,334 \%$ return on equity, or 13.7 times CSI's equity investment in one year since all the figures are in 2008 dollars. The highest Net Profit is $\$ 55.7$ million, a $5,388 \%$ return on equity investment or 55 times the CSI equity investment in one year. The Proposed Development returns are in between these returns.

Even without context, a range of possible returns of $1300 \%$ to $5500 \%$, or 13 to 55 times return on equity investment in current dollars, represents a reasonable return on the property by any standards.

Honorable Chair and Members of the Board of Standards and Appeals June 10, 2008
Page 2

These returns are based on CSI produced scenarios and assumptions and do not include the added benefit to CSI gained from income producing property, for which we have not been provided adequate figures.

Sincerely,


## Appendices

I. Estimated CSI Acquisition Costs, 1949 \& 1965, Restated in 2008 Dollars
II. Estimated CSI Return On Equity 2008
III. Supporting Documents for Appendix I

## Estimated CSI ACQUISITION Costs, 1949 \& 1965. RESTATED IN 2008 DOLLARS

The Appendix I table shows the range of possible acquisition costs in 1949 for $6-8 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$ and in 1965 for 10 W. $70^{\text {th }}$, and are then restated in 2008 dollars based on the Consumer Price Index Inflator (CPI).

The acquisition values used, and then restated in 2008 dollars, are from:

- New York City tax valuations. "Assessed Real Estate Valuations Without Improvements" (i.e. the land) and With Improvements in 1949 and 1965, the acquisition years.
- Indenture Agreements between buyers, Trustees of the Congregation Shearith Israel or Congregation Shearith Israel, respectively in 1949 and 1965 and the sellers.
- Acquisition costs of $15 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$ in 1948. This address is diagonally across the street from the Community House and is the only property on which we have the actual Purchase Price (Acquisition Costs) from 1948.

Extensive research does not reveal purchase price as part of the public record. Articles in the New York Times from the period almost always report tax valuations for private sales.

Values reflect the decline of the neighborhood by 1949 and, although on the cusp of rejuvenation in 1965, this year preceded re-gentrification of the Upper West Side.

Supporting documents for data in this Appendix is included in Appendix III.
appendix I


[^0]
# Estimated CSI Return On Equity 2008 

Item M-5, Financial Feasibility Study, BSA Rules, state:

> 5. Generally, for cooperative or condominium development proposals the following information is required: market value of the property, acquisition costs and date of acquisition, ...... and percentage return on equity (net profit divided by equity). [Emphasis added]

For simplicity, it is assumed for all cases that the CSI equity is $\$ 1,033,000$, the highest Acquisition Costs for \#6-10 W. 70th in 1949 and 1965 inflated to 2008 dollars as shown in Appendix I.

The Net Profit is the gain on the total value of the property \#6-10 W. 70th, using the value of the total property in 2008 less the amount paid for the three lots of $\$ 1,033,000$, which represents the figure restated in 2008 dollars, for an apples to apples comparison.

Taking Freeman/Frazer Associates (FFA) and Platt Byard Dovell White (PBDW) assumptions, there are two ways to calculate market value for the property as a whole in 2008.

1. The total property value in 2008 can be based on PBDW's allocations of square feet, applied to the condo residences and the Community House including the cellars, scaling FFA's value on the residences to arrive at a Community House and the total value.
2. The total property value in 2008 can be based on the application of FFA's $\$ 625 /$ square feet multiplied by the PBDW sq.footage.

This Appendix II Table applies these assumptions to three cases: the FFA Proposed Development case of the May 13, 2008 submission and the FAA As-of-Right cases, AOR Scheme A and the AOR Scheme C, both dated December 21, 2008.

The lowest return is AOR Scheme C at a Net Profit on the property of $\$ 13.7$ million in 2008 dollars, a $1,334 \%$ return on equity or 13.7 times CSI's equity investment. The highest Net Profit is $\$ 55.7$ million, a $5.388 \%$ return on equity investment or 55 times the CSI equity investment. The Proposed Development is in between these returns.

It is believed that the returns are understated since the property has generated income for CSI over the years, in excess of maintenance costs.

Based on the forecast annual revenue from the schools of $\$ 1,000,000$, the capitalized value at $7 \%$ is $\$ 14,285,714$. This amount is not included in the Net Profit of the Appendix II Table but should be added when considering the total benefit to CSI

Since CSI has not provided the revenue or costs of the Community House historically or forecast, more refined analysis cannot be done.
Proposed Dev
condos

| FFA | PBDW Sq Ft Allocation ${ }^{2}$ | Total Property Value 2008 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Equity } 1 \\ & 2008 \$ \$ \end{aligned}$ | Net Gain/ Profit | Return on Investment (equity) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PBDW Sq } \\ & \mathrm{Ft}^{2} \end{aligned}$ | Total <br> Value. FFA <br> \$625/sq ft | Equity 1 2008 \$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Col 1 | Col 2 <br> [Based on <br> Sq ft in Col <br> 7) | Col 3 <br> [Col 2 \% applied to Residential in Col 1) | Col 4 [from Appendix I) | Col 5 <br> [Col 3-Col 4\} | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Col } 6 \\ & {\left[\begin{array}{c} \text { Coll } 5 / \mathrm{Col} 4] \end{array}\right.} \\ & { }^{100} \end{aligned}$ | Col 7 | Col 8 [\$625/sq ft X Col 7] | Col 9 [same as Col 4. From Appendix1] |
| \$ | \% | \$ | \$ | \$ | \% | sq ft | \$ | \$ |

## SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS FOR APPENDIX I

Supporting documents included in this Appendix are support for the Acquisition Costs in Appendix I, and include the:

- Assessed Valuation of Real Estate-Borough of Manhattan-Section 4, Blocks 1121-1127, page 15 in the year of $1950-1951$ of $6-8 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$. See column "Value of Real Estate Unimproved" and "Value of Real Estate with Improvements Thereon".
- Assessed Valuation of Real Estate-Borough of Manhattan-Section 4, Blocks 1121-1128, page 12 in the year of 1966-1967 of 10 W. $70^{\text {th }}$. See columns "Value of Real Estate Unimproved" and "Value of Real Estate with Improvements Thereon".
- Indenture Agreements between the Trustees of CSI with the seller of $6-8 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$ dated August 31, 1949:
in consideration of ONE (\$1.00) dollar......and other good and valuable consideration......
- The Indenture Agreements between CSI and the seller of $10 \mathrm{~W} .70^{\text {th }}$ dated May 28,1965 :
in consideration of Ten Dollars and other good and other valuable consideration......
SUBJECT to a mortgage recorded in......in the original amount of $\$ 11,750.00$.
- Closing Statement dated June 15,1948 for 15 W. $70^{\text {th }}$ with the Acquisition Cost (Purchase Price) of $\$ 32,000$.

The Acquisition Cost (Purchase Price) was about the same as the Assessed Valuation of Real Estate with Improvements. Two years later the tax valuation increased from $\$ 33,000$ increased to $\$ 40,000$.

- The Consumer Price Index Inflator (CPI) computed by Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis can be found at the end of this Appendix. The CPI was applied to the Acquisition Costs in Appendix I.






## 14636 f 510

©isurany roxal ne

THIS INDENTURE, matron


part $y$ of the ecrond part.
WITNESSHTII, fiat , he fit, af the first pert, w cronideration of

```
    䊾 (悉\.00)
                            #
    * - - m - Sollary.
```


by the part $y$. af the second part, dexe hercby kiant and ielease unto the pant y

Alf. thet lot or ferosl of lend, with the buildings and improvementa thoreon, In thre Borouph of Manhetton, City, county and state of Hex lork, boinded and doseribed ab rollowst

EXCAIDIKG at a polnt on the g:atheriy adde of serantieth gtreet diatant one hundrod and elght fect watorly from the cormer formed by
 wosterly gide of Contrel rark west (rormerly Ejgith avonue); running
thenne outherly, parallol with yelf fontrel rark tost, one hundred
Coot rivo laches th lianconter ljon it lue bliock; thonce westerly


a perty wall, one handred cont five ifichos to tho watheriy side of
Beventioth stregi, anj tionce oatorly wlona saía suthorly ido of
Sevontioth itrant, tmentg-one rant tuthe pojnt or place of Beandiko.

Berentleth 3troet.




THIS INDENTURE, made the 28th day of May , nineteen hundred and sixtyy five is BETWEEN

PARKSEVENTII IMPROVEMENT CORP., a domestic corporation, having its principal office at 237 East 24th Street, New York City,
party of the first part, and THE CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL in the Clty of New York, having its principal office at 8 West 70th Street, New Yoxk Clty, New Yoxk,
party of the second part,
WIINESSETHI, that the party of the first part, in consideration of Ten Dollars and other valuable consideration paid by the party of the second part, does hereby grant and relcase unto the party of the second part, the heirs or successors and assigns of the party of the second part forever,
All that certain plot, piece or parcel of land, with the buildings and improvements thereon erected, situate lying and being in the Borough of Manhattan, City, County and State of New York, boumded and described as follows:

BEGINNING at a point on the southerly side of 70 th Street distant $\cdot 150$ feet westerly from the southwesterly cornex of 70 th Street and Central Park West; rumning thence southerly and parallel with Central Park West 100 feet 5 inchea; thence westerly and parallel with 70 th street 22 feet; thence northerly and parallel with Central Park West and through a party wall 100 feet 5 inches to the southerly side of 70 th Street; thence easterly along the southerly side of '70th Street' 22 feet to the point or place of BEGINNING.
SAID PREMISES now being known as and by the street Number 10 West 70th Street.

SUBJECT to a mortgage recorded in Liber 5812 of Mortgages, Page 486, in the original amount of $\$ 11,750.00$.

THIS CONVEYANCE J.s executed with the manimous consent of all stockholders of PARKSEVENTY IMPROVEMENT CORP.

SUBJBCT to covenants, easements, reservations and restrictions, if any, of record.

TOGETHER with, all right, title' and iuterest, if any, of the party of the first part in and to any strects and roads abutting the above described premises to the center lines thereof; TOGETHER with the apourtenances and all the estate and rights of the party of the first part in and to said premises; TO HAVE AND TO HOLD the premises herein granted unto the party of the second part, the heirs or strecessors and assigns of the party of the second part forever.

AND the party of the first part covenants that the party of the frrst part bas not done or suffered anything whereby the said premises have been encumbered in any way whatever, except as aforesaid. AND the party of the first part, in compliance with Section 13 of the Lien Law, covenants that the party of the first part will receive the consideration for this conveyance and will hold the right to receive such conssideration as a trust fund to be applied first for the purpose of paying the cost of the improvement and will apply. the same first to the payment of the cost of the improvernent before using any part of the total of the same for any other purpose
The word "party" shall be construed as if it read. "parties" whenever the sense of this indenture so requires.
 written.
IF PRESENCR OF:


CLOSIHO STATSHE of closing of title to premises 15 Weat 7oth Street, Wnhttum Boroug New York City prar-
 and Fdmund Ewill, botu weslesing at 15 West 7oth gtreet, Now




 was assigned to Stentyturefot and ilition. Brown by asaignmant dated Aprit $9 t n^{\prime} 1848$.

Title iumber 632303 of Lawvers mqtle Corporation of Nov York, on sale transgction.

TItike number 632002 of Lawers litile Corporation of Nex tork, on mintgage transaction.
closing of both tranagctions at office of Barry, Tainwright, Thacher \& Symers, 72 Wall Street, New York City, N. X., attorneys for The Seamen's
Bank for Savings in the city of New York.



 for hamyers Title Corporation; Honm on Proffitt and John J. Schaefer, for attorneys for the Bank.

Faid on contract $\$ 3800.00$ Price
Adjustment of insurance, (see helow) 63.99 Water adjustment (\$45) 24.38 100 zallong of fuel on premises at lif. $3 \%$ mer Hallon; Hosl estate taxes paid to Jure 30th, 1948, (\$496.E8)
41.39

要药, 142.06
Total Credzts
pata on olosing
$3,200.00$
$528,648.08$
Receivea from the ellers executor'g deed to the purchasers as tenamis in oomino which deod was delivered to the titio oompeng represtantetive far rocoraing.

The mellanats ath itund celivered to the bak a
 a check fram the bint tur 3 , 8000.00 made to the oxtion of Roze Brill lnalvidualiy ant of oxecutrix and Edmandish Exeoutrix of Abrahim Billi, Aearaned which was delivered over to the attomey far tivertert.
followa:



Cheok of lie tuohea Nationsl Bank, \#17941 to the order of Milton W. brown, and andorsed by him to sellers,

4,225.00
Certified choulc of 沙ilton 1.
Brown, dumpon Hanitecturer's Trust Company, 100 Fark Kow. N. Y. C.p to bls order and endorsed by him to sellers, $4,346.03$ Check of alioe forder ineltzoff, certifled, and drem on Chemical Bank \& Truat Company, to the order of Stanley helteaff ind endoraed by him to sellers,
$5,371.03$
Total pald on closing,
228,942.06
The excess of $\$ 1600.00$ paid hy Hrown on the closing, represents a repayment to doltzof of $\$ 1600.00$ advanced by bitzoff for Brown on the payment of $32,00.00$ on 3fphang of the contract of purchase.

The inaufanoe premium edjusted on alosing represonts polioy of United states Fire Enpurance Company, amount $\$ 45000.00$, No. 458sts, dated $5 / 8 / 47$ expimes $5 / 8 / 50$. This polley was delifernd to the attorney for the bank to have game changed to the bank as mortgagee and the owners, as their intercsts may appear, and a certifioato thereol will be ielivered to purchesers upon issuance tinereof.

The purchesers also delivered and executed affidavits of citizenahip, and an alathorization to the bank to pay the aforementioned sum of 15000,00 direct ta the sell. ers.

Recelved from attorney for sellars affldavit of hose Exill that no postrumous child or chlloren has or have been or will be born of har marriage to Auraham A. Brill.

Fecelved from attorney for aellers, recelpted tax bill for 1947-1948 real estate taxes, recespitied water b111 for 1948 Fater, blu print of aurvey; keys, and letter of Petroloum Heat is Poxer Co, inc., as to fuel on premises.
fine following exponses wore pald by cheoks of Stanloy theitzof'f issued on the closing:

Charges of Lawyers Titie corp.: $u$ © foilowa:
Examination of title to ise, ilio. $7 \%$
Chocking aurvey,
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { sortgage tax on mortgafes } & 75.00\end{array}$
Examination of title ior mortgage policy, 171.00
Fiecording daed, $\quad 4.00$
$\pi_{\text {Bcorilng mortgaze, }}$ Total.
13.00

Charge of attornys for bank,
Change of attennty for ellers
for at temainume of office, of
attexpoys for buniky
\$413.75
$\$ 50,00$
+15.00
478.75

The bond and mortgage made to the bank is payable as follows, and mans with interest at 4i\% fron June 15th, 1948:

Aupust lat, 1948, for interest and anowtization, and monthly thereafter,
June 15 th, 2260 , balanoe of mortgage due.
frivilege to pay off mortgage at any time after fune 14th, 1933, upon giving ic dave nots ce and payint 60 days additional intersst,

Real eatate taxec are due octoner let anc April ist.
\#ator mates are due Janary ist, lis: whe vealy thereafter and may be paid without nemalty during the month of January in agch vear.

Tho nortpage also provides that rou aro to ingtall
te: kittehens, convert the buildsng to two-finily use, are cocorkte sane for use as a doctors offices on the ground flon's all tio be complated by tecember lsth, 1544.

##  <br> COMMUNITY <br> OEVELOFMENF <br> consumes FORMATION <br> e OATA <br> What is a dollar worth?

ECOnOMIC
tGUCATEON
RESOURCES
NEWS
EVENTS

PUBLICATIONS

 FENANCTI㓱 INSTITy HONS

I'm at: Home > Economic Research \& Data > Data > U.S. Data > CPI Calculator

The Consumer Price Index (CPI) is a measure of the average change in prices over time in a market basket of goods and services. The Bureau of Labor Statistics releases CPI data monthly.


RESOURCES

Advanced Search Glossary

- Consumer Price Index and Inflation Rates, 1913-
- Consumer Price Index and Inflation Rates (Estimate), 1800-
- How the CPI is used to make these calculations

Directions: Enter years as 4 digits (i.e. 1913) through 2008. Enter dollar amount without commas or $\$$ sign in box on first line. Click Calculate button to compute dollar amount shown on second line.

$$
\text { If in } 1965 \text { (year) }
$$

I bought goods or services for $\$ 1$,
then in 2008 (year)
the same goods or services would cost $\$ 6.84$
Calculate Reset

## Notes:

- Limited to years from 1913 to 2008.
- Data from consumer price indexes for all major expenditure class items.
- An estimate for 2008 is based on the change in the CPI from fourth quarter 2006 to fourth quarter 2007.
- Base year is chained; $1982-1984=100$
- JavaScript-enabled browsers only.

How the CPI is used to make these calculations.

- What would an item or service purchased in 2008 be worth in 19?? dollars?


## Example:

The CPI is used to calculate how prices have changed over the years. Let's say you have $\$ 7$ in your pocket to purchase some goods and services today. How much money would you have needed in 1950 to buy the same amount of goods and services?

The CPI for $1950=24.1$
The CPI for $2008=215.6$
Use the following formula to compute the calculation: 1950 Price $=2008$ Price $\times(1950 \mathrm{CPI} / 2008 \mathrm{CPI})$ $\$ 0.78=\$ 7.00 \times(24.1 / 215.6)$

- What would an item or service purchased in 19?? be worth in 2008

rOUCAY:ON RESOQRCES

NEWS tVENTS


I'm at: Home > Economic Research \& Data > Data > U.S, Data > CPI Caiculator

## What is a dollar worth?

The Consumer Price Index (CPI) is a measure of the average change in prices over time in a market basket of goods and services. The Bureau of Labor Statistics releases CPI data monthly.


## RESOURCES

Advanced Search
Glossary


- Consumer Price Index and Inflation Rates, 1913-
- Consumer Price Index and Inflation Rates (Estimate). 1800 -
- How the CPI is used to make these calculations

Directions: Enter years as 4 digits (i.e. 1913) through 2008. Enter dollar amount without commas or $\$$ sign in box on first line. Click Calculate button to compute dollar amount shown on second line.

If in 1965 (year)
I bought goods or services for $\$ 24500$,
then in 2008 (year)
thie same goods or services would cost $\$ 167688.89$


## Notes:

- Limited to years from 1913 to 2008.
- Data from consumer price indexes for all major expenditure class items.
- An estimate for 2008 is based on the change in the CPI from fourth quarter 2006 to fourth quarter 2007.
- Base year is chained; 1982-1984 $=100$
- JavaScript-enabled browsers only.

How the CPI is used to make these calculations.

- What would an item or service purchased in 2008 be worth in 19?? dollars?


## Example:

The CPI is used to calculate how prices have changed over the years. Let's say you have $\$ 7$ in your pocket to purchase some goods and services today. How much money would you have needed in 1950 to buy the same amount of goods and services?

The CPI for $1950=24.1$
The CPI for $2008=215.6$
Use the following formula to compute the calculation:
1950 Price $=2008$ Price $\times(1950$ CPI $/ 2008$ CPI $)$
$\$ 0.78=\$ 7.00 \times(24.1 / 215.6)$

- What would an item or service purchased in 19?? be worth in 2008


## dollars?

## Example:

Let's say your parents told you that in 1950 a movie cost 25 cents. How could you tell if movies have increased in price faster or slower than most goods and services? To convert that price into today's dollars, use the CPI.

The CPI for $1950=24.1$
The CPI for $2008=215.6$
A movie in $1950=\$ 0.25$
Use the following formula to compute the calculation:
2008 Price $=1950$ Price $\times(2008 \mathrm{CPI} / 1950 \mathrm{CPI})$
$\$ 2.24=\$ 0.25 \times(215.6 / 24.1)$
A full-price movie at a Minneapolis theater costs between $\$ 6.00$ and $\$ 9.00$. Looks like movies have increased in price faster than most other goods and services.


[^0]:    1. Lot\#36, 99 Central Park West, also block 1122, was purchased by Congregation Shearith Israel (not the

    Trustees) in 1985 from Charles F. and Eleanor L. Hoffiman and is the property occupied by the Parsonage and the
    synnagogue.
    2.70th St Holding Co. Inc had the same address as the Trustees Congregation Shearith Israel, 2 west 70th,
    Trustees) in 1985 from Charles F. and Eleanor L. Hoffman and is the property occupied by the Parsonage and the
    synagogue.
    2.70 th St Holding Co. Inc had the same address as the Trustees Congregation Shearith Israel, 2 west 70th,
    indicating that the purchase may not have not have been an arms length transaction. 70 th St Holding Co. Inc had
    purchased the property from E. Zippa a year before.
    3. At some point after the purchase of \#6 and \#8, the Lots 37 and 38 were merged into one property, became
    exempt,. and for city records became Lot 37 .
    exempt,, and for city records became Lot 37 .
    5. Extenuating circumstances could have been taxes in arrears, imminent or actual foreclosure, bankruptcy of the
    owners, no maintenance and houses on verge of collapse. ...
    6. The sum of the "Acquisition Costs" or Purchase Price for $\# 6-10$ is $\$ 1,033,000$ in 2008 dollars.
    7. The supporting documents for assumptions made in this Appendix are found in Appendix III.
    8. The 2008 dollars for Acquisition Costs are based on the Consumer Price (CPI) index inflator as provided by the
    Federal Resenve Bank of Minneapolis.

    Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis.

